

House of Bishops Business Meeting
Little America Hotel, Salt Lake City, Utah
September 18, 2009

The business meeting of the House was called to order at 10:00 a.m. by Presiding Bishop Katharine Jefferts Schori. Prayers were offered by Chaplain Carol Wade and the roll of bishops was called by Secretary Bishop Kenneth Price. It was determined that the 127 bishops present represented significantly more than a quorum. Bishop Clifton Daniel moved, on behalf of the Dispatch of Business Committee, the agenda for the day. It was adopted.

The Presiding Bishop then recognized Vice President Bishop Dick Chang who moved that the House go into a Committee of the Whole to discuss the matter of the deposition of Bishop Robert Duncan. Parliamentarian Bishop John Buchanan explained that as a Committee of the Whole no minutes would be taken and no motions made. The rest of the morning session was spent as a committee of the whole in which 21 bishops spoke. The morning section of the business session recessed for Holy Eucharist at 11:45 a.m. and lunch

The business session resumed at 2:00 and the Committee of the Whole continued with 14 more speakers. When no more speakers requested to be recognized the Presiding Bishop declared the Committee of the Whole to be ended and the following motion was made and seconded.

“RESOLVED, that pursuant to Canon IV.9.2 of the Episcopal Church, the House of Bishops hereby consents to the Deposition from the ordained ministry of the Rt. Rev. Robert W. Duncan, Bishop of the Diocese of Pittsburgh.”

The following explanation accompanied the resolution.

EXPLANATION: On December 17, 2007, the Title IV Review Committee certified to the Presiding Bishop, pursuant to Canon IV.9.1, that the Rt. Rev. Robert W. Duncan, Bishop of the Diocese of Pittsburgh, had “abandoned the communion of this Church by an open renunciation of the Doctrine, Discipline or Worship of this Church.” In the intervening months since the Presiding Bishop gave notice to Bishop Duncan of the foregoing certification, Bishop Duncan has failed to submit to the Presiding Bishop sufficient retraction or denial of the actions found by the Title IV Review Committee. Accordingly, the Presiding Bishop has presented the matter to the House of Bishops and requested consent to Bishop Duncan’s Deposition.

Bishop William Love then called for division with the following statement:

“We the undersigned being voting members of the House of Bishops, hereby call for division of each and every vote of this House on any matter put to vote with respect to the status of the Bishop of Pittsburgh as a bishop and member of this House of Bishops and that each member’s vote, whether it be aye or nay, be entered in the journal.”

This above call was signed by Bishops William Love, James Adams, David Reed, Michael Smith, Edward Little, GERALYN Wolf, Mark Lawrence, John Howe and Bruce MacPherson. She ruled that the roll would be called on the final vote.

Bishop Michael Smith made a challenge was then made and seconded regarding the chair's ruling that no inhibition was needed before the house considered deposition. The matter was put to a vote and more than the requisite 2/3 vote sustained her ruling.

Bishop Lawrence made a challenge was then made and seconded regarding the chair's ruling that the requisite votes for deposition would be arrived at by a majority of the bishops eligible to vote who were present at this meeting. The matter was put to a vote and more than the requisite 2/3 vote sustained her ruling.

Prayer was then offered by Chaplain Carol Wade and the roll was called on the matter of the deposition of Bishop Robert Duncan. The motion passed by a vote of 88 Ayes. 35 Nays and 4 Abstentions. A complete list of the votes of the 127 bishops present is as follows:

RECORD OF VOTES CAST REGARDING THE DEPOSITION OF BISHOP DUNCAN

Consecration Number	Consecration Date	Name	Role	Diocese	Vote re: Duncan
627	11/26/67	William Frey	Assisting	Rio Grande	n
665	9/12/71	Otis Charles	Resigned		y
721	10/31/77	Bob Jones	Resigned		y
722	2/11/78	Robert Anderson	Assistant	Los Angeles	y
779	1/21/84	James Ottley	Assistant	Long Island	y
780	1/25/84	Leopold Frade	Diocesan	Southeast Florida	y
785	5/19/84	Peter Lee	Diocesan	Virginia	n
804	2/15/85	Allen Bartlett	Resigned		y
812	10/11/86	Arthur Williams	Resigned		y
819	2/24/87	E. Don Taylor	Assistant	New York	y
830	9/27/88	C. Christopher Epting	Bishop for Ecumenical and Interreligious Relations		y
835	2/25/89	John Buchanan	Assistant	Southern Virginia	y
839	4/15/89	John Howe	Diocesan	Central Florida	n
844	8/20/89	Sergio Carranza	Assistant	Los Angeles	y
854	3/24/90	Charles Keyser	Assisting	Florida	y
861	1/26/91	Chester Talton	Suffragan	Los Angeles	y
864	3/15/91	Victor Scantlebury	Assistant	Chicago	y
865	3/23/91	Steven Charleston	Assistant	California	y
868	6/9/91	Jerry Lamb	Provisional Bishop of San Joaquin		y
869	6/15/91	Alfred Marble	Assisting	North Carolina	y
870	8/16/91	Julio Holguin	Diocesan	Dominican Republic	a
872	2/29/92	Peter Beckwith	Diocesan	Springfield	n
876	11/19/92	Jane Holmes Dixon	Resigned		y

Consecration Number	Consecration Date	Name	Role	Diocese	Vote re: Duncan
879	3/6/93	James Stanton	Diocesan	Dallas	n
883	9/11/93	F. Clayton Matthews	Bishop for Pastoral Development		y
885	10/29/93	James Jelinek	Diocesan	Minnesota	y
891	4/17/94	Edwin Gulick	Diocesan	Kentucky	y
894	5/24/94	Russell Jacobus	Diocesan	Fond du Lac	a
900	10/29/94	Kenneth Price	Suffragan	Southern Ohio	y
901	1/21/95	Henry Louttit	Diocesan	Georgia	y
902	2/3/95	Dorsey Henderson	Diocesan	Upper South Carolina	n
904	3/25/95	Vernon Strickland	Resigned		y
907	6/24/95	David Jones	Suffragan	Virginia	y
909	10/21/95	Robert Ihloff	Resigned		y
912	1/27/96	Catherine Roskam	Suffragan	New York	y
913	2/17/96	Geralyn Wolf	Diocesan	Rhode Island	n
917	5/4/96	Andrew Smith	Diocesan	Connecticut	y
918	5/31/96	Carolyn Irish	Diocesan	Utah	y
919	6/29/96	Paul Marshall	Diocesan	Bethlehem	y
922	9/21/96	Clifton Daniel	Diocesan	East Carolina	y
924	10/12/96	Gordon Scruton	Diocesan	Western Massachusetts	y
925	10/26/96	F. Neff Powell	Diocesan	Southwestern Virginia	y
926	1/4/97	Richard S.O. Chang	Resigned		y
929	6/7/97	Catherine Waynick	Diocesan	Indianapolis	y
930	6/28/97	C. Wallis Ohl	Diocesan	Northwest Texas	n
933	9/13/97	Mark MacDonald	Diocesan	Navajoland	a
934	9/26/97	Bruce Caldwell	Diocesan	Wyoming	y
936	1/31/98	Charles Jenkins	Diocesan	Louisiana	n
937	3/14/98	Barry Howe	Diocesan	West Missouri	y
938	3/28/98	Chilton Knudsen	Resigned		y
939	4/25/98	Mark Sisk	Diocesan	New York	y
940	6/6/98	Harry Bainbridge	Diocesan	Idaho	y
942	10/10/98	John Rabb	Suffragan	Maryland	n
944	2/27/99	Charles vonRosenberg	Diocesan	East Tennessee	n
945	3/13/99	William Persell	Resigned		y
946	4/10/99	Keith Whitmore	Assistant	Atlanta	y
947	4/24/99	J. Michael Garrison	Diocesan	Western New York	y
949	10/9/99	D. Bruce MacPherson	Diocesan	Western Louisiana	n
950	2/5/00	Wendell Gibbs	Diocesan	Michigan	y
951	2/12/00	George Packard	Bishop Suffragan for Chaplaincies		n
952	3/18/00	Edward Little	Diocesan	Northern Indiana	n
953	4/29/00	J. Jon Bruno	Diocesan	Los Angeles	y
955	6/17/00	Michael Curry	Diocesan	North Carolina	y
956	6/17/00	Duncan Gray	Diocesan	Mississippi	n
957	9/23/00	William Gregg	Assistant	North Carolina	y
958	9/30/00	Stacy Sauls	Diocesan	Lexington	y
959	10/14/00	James Curry	Suffragan	Connecticut	y

Consecration Number	Consecration Date	Name	Role	Diocese	Vote re: Duncan
961	10/21/00	James Waggoner	Diocesan	Spokane	y
963	2/24/01	Katharine Jefferts Schori	Presiding Bishop		y
965	4/28/01	Thomas Ely	Diocesan	Vermont	y
966	5/12/01	Philip Duncan	Diocesan	Central Gulf Coast	y
968	7/7/01	J. Neil Alexander	Diocesan	Atlanta	y
969	7/14/01	Francisco Duque	Diocesan	Colombia	y
970	10/13/01	William Klusmeyer	Diocesan	West Virginia	n
971	10/20/01	Lloyd Allen	Diocesan	Honduras	n
972	10/27/01	Gladstone Adams	Diocesan	Central New York	y
973	11/18/01	Pierre Whalon	Suffragan	American Churches in Europe	a
974	2/7/02	Marc Andrus	Diocesan	California	y
975	3/2/02	G. Wayne Smith	Diocesan	Missouri	y
976	3/16/02	James Adams	Diocesan	Western Kansas	n
979	6/1/02	John Chane	Diocesan	Washington	y
981	1/18/03	Gayle Harris	Suffragan	Massachusetts	y
982	1/25/03	James Shand	Diocesan	Easton	n
983	4/5/03	Alan Scarfe	Diocesan	Iowa	n
984	11/28/97	David Alvarez	Diocesan	Puerto Rico	y
985	9/13/03	Joe Burnett	Diocesan	Nebraska	y
987	9/27/03	C. Franklin Brookhart	Diocesan	Montana	n
989	10/4/03	Robert O'Neill	Diocesan	Colorado	y
990	10/18/03	George Cuncell	Diocesan	New Jersey	n
991	10/18/03	Steven Miller	Diocesan	Milwaukee	n
992	11/1/03	S. Johnson Howard	Diocesan	Florida	y
993	11/2/03	V. Gene Robinson	Diocesan	New Hampshire	y
994	11/8/03	Dean Wolfe	Diocesan	Kansas	y
995	2/21/04	Gary Lillibridge	Diocesan	West Texas	n
996	4/24/04	Kirk Smith	Diocesan	Arizona	y
997	4/17/04	Mark Hollingsworth	Diocesan	Ohio	y
998	5/8/04	Michael Smith	Diocesan	North Dakota	n
999	9/18/04	G. Porter Taylor	Diocesan	Western North Carolina	y
1001	1/22/05	Bavi Rivera	Suffragan	Olympia	y
1002	3/5/05	James Mathes	Diocesan	San Diego	y
1003	6/11/05	E. Ambrose Gumbs	Diocesan	Virgin Islands	n
1005	8/26/06	David Reed	Suffragan	West Texas	n
1006	9/9/06	S. Todd Ousley	Diocesan	Eastern Michigan	y
1007	9/16/06	William Love	Diocesan	Albany	n
1008	9/30/06	Barry Beisner	Diocesan	Northern California	y
1010	10/26/06	Nathan Baxter	Diocesan	Central Pennsylvania	y
1011	1/6/07	Larry Benfield	Diocesan	Arkansas	y
1012	1/27/07	Mark Beckwith	Diocesan	Newark	y
1013	1/27/07	John Bauerschmidt	Diocesan	Tennessee	n
1014	3/10/07	Dabney Smith	Diocesan	Southwest Florida	n
1015	3/10/07	Robert Fitzpatrick	Diocesan	Hawaii	y

Consecration Number	Consecration Date	Name	Role	Diocese	Vote re: Duncan
1016	4/28/07	Thomas Breidenthal	Diocesan	Southern Ohio	y
1017	5/26/07	Shannon Johnston	Coadjutor	Virginia	n
1018	6/30/07	Laura Ahrens	Suffragan	Connecticut	y
1019	9/8/07	Sean Rowe	Diocesan	Northwestern Pennsylvania	y
1020	9/15/07	Edward Konieczny	Diocesan	Oklahoma	n
1021	9/15/07	Gregory Rickel	Diocesan	Olympia	y
1022	11/10/07	Mary Gray-Reeves	Diocesan	El Camino Real	y
1023	1/5/08	Dan Edwards	Diocesan	Nevada	y
1024	1/12/08	John McKee Sloan	Suffragan	Alabama	n
1025	1/26/08	Mark Lawrence	Diocesan	South Carolina	n
1026	2/2/08	Jeffrey Lee	Diocesan	Chicago	y
1027	1/25/94	Sylvestre Romero	Assisting	New Jersey	y
1028	5/3/08	Stephen Lane	Diocesan	Maine	y
1029	5/31/08	Prince Singh	Diocesan	Rochester	y
1030	6/28/08	Eugene Sutton	Diocesan	Maryland	y
1031	7/12/08	Paul Lambert	Suffragan	Dallas	n

The Rules of Order call for the introduction of new bishops at each business meeting. The Presiding Bishop had introduced them the day before. They are:

Bishop Steven Lane, Bishop Diocesan of Maine
 Bishop Prince Singh, Bishop Diocesan of Rochester
 Bishop Eugene Sutton, Bishop Diocesan of Maryland
 Bishop Paul Lambert, Bishop Suffragan of Dallas

The Rev. Brian Thom, elected Bishop Diocesan of Idaho, was also introduced. His consents have been received but he is not yet consecrated.

The following bishops, who have died since our last meeting, also were remembered with a moment of silence. They are:

Bishop Robert Spears, Rochester, resigned
 Bishop Ronald Haines, Washington, resigned
 Bishop Frank Vest, Southern Virginia, resigned
 Bishop Jose Gonzalez, Newark, resigned

As a communication from the Presiding Bishop, Bishop Jefferts Schori explained that in the matter of inhibited Bishop Charles Bennison of Pennsylvania, we are still waiting a verdict from the Trial Court. Bishop Allen Bartlett will continue serving as Assisting Bishop of the Diocese of Pennsylvania until December 31. The Presiding Bishop will meet with the Standing Committee on October 3 to discuss next steps.

After comments from six bishops regarding a desire to be clear in explaining the actions

of the House regarding the deposition of Bishop Duncan, the House shared in prayer and took a brief break.

Bishop Chilton Knudsen, reporting for the Committee on the Resignation of Bishops, moved that the resignations of Bishops Harry Bainbridge and Wallis Ohl both be accepted, the canonical reason being “advanced age.” Both resignations were accepted.

The agenda as set forth in the Rules of Order is the reading of the minutes of the last meeting. Motion was made to dispense with this reading as the minutes are posted on the College of Bishop web site. Motion Passed.

Several announcements were made, Bishop Chris Epting reported on ecumenical and interreligious issues coming to General Convention. These include full communion with the Moravians, a modest proposal for relations with the Presbyterians and principles and approaches to be used in interreligious talks. He also announced his office is now in Omaha, Nebraska.

The Presiding Bishop then called on bishops to reflect on the actions of this meeting, and after 13 bishops spoke, the meeting was adjourned.

Certified

Kenneth L. Price Jr., secretary
House of Bishops

James Mathes, chair,
Committee on Certification of Minute

Michael Smith
Committee on Certification of Minutes